A SUMMARY COMPARISON OF THE
GOVERNMENT "WHITE PAPER" AND THE INDIANS "RED PAPER"

YOUR WHITE PAPER :	THE RED PAPER :
The legislative and constitutional bases of discrimination should be removed.	The legislative and constitutional bases for Indian status and rights should be maintained until such time as Indian people are prepared and willing to renegotiate them.
There should be a positive recognition of the unique contribution of Indian culture to Canadian life.	These are nice sounding words which are intended to mislead everybody. The only way to maintain our culture is for us to remain as Indians.
Services should come through the same channels and from the same government agencies for all Canadians.	Indians have a right of access to the same services as are available to all Canadians plus those additional rights and privileges which were established by the British North America Act and by subsequent treaties and legislation.
Those who are furthest behind should be helped most.	These promises are bait to catch us in the trap of the rest of the policy. The Federal Government is trying to divide us Indian people so it can conquer us by saying that the poorer reserves will be helped most. Indian people and the organizations they

POLAR
PAM
398

POLARPAM

16446

YOUR WHITE PAPER :	THE RED PAPER :
	support should be given the resources and the responsibility to determine their own priorities and future lines of development.
Lawful obligations should be recognized.	If the Government meant what it said, we would be happy. But it is obvious that the Government has never bothered to learn what the treaties are and has a distorted picture of them. The Government shows that it is wilfully ignorant of the bargains that were made. Lawful obligations, including those concerned with aboriginal rights, unfulfilled promises, and treaty provisions should be recognized.
Control of Indian lands should be transferred to the Indian people.	We agree with this intent but we find that the Government is ignorant of two basic points. The Government wrongly thinks that the Indian Reserve lands are owned by the Crown. These lands are "held" by the Crown but they are Indian lands. The second error the Government commits is making the assumption that Indians can have control of their land only if they take ownership in the way that ordinary property is owned. Control of Indian lands should be maintained by the Indian people, respecting their historical and legal rights as Indians.

YOUR WHITE PAPER :

The Government would be prepared to...

...Propose to Parliament that the Indian Act be repealed and take such legislative steps as may be necessary to enable Indians to control Indian lands and to acquire title to them.

THE RED PAPER :

We reject the proposal that The Indian Act be repealed. It is essential to review it but not before the question of the treaties is settled and there is a consensus with the Indian people respecting their historical and legal rights as Indians.

...make funds available for Indian economic development as an interim measure.

We say it is not realistic to suppose that short-term assistance with economic development as an interim measure will be adequate. The promise of substantial funds must be followed by actually making these monies available for Indian social and cultural, as well as economic development, with the emphasis in each case to be determined by the Indians concerned. The Government should give special consideration to the proposed Alberta Indian Development System, as a possible pattern of Federal-Provincial-Indian co-operation in community development.

THE WHITE PAPER :

...wind up that part of the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development which deals with Indian affairs. The residual responsibilities of the Federal Government for the programs in the field of Indian affairs would be transferred to other appropriate federal departments.

THE RED PAPER :

We believe the Department of Indian Affairs, in its present archaic and paternalistic form, should be wound up. There should be established instead a smaller federal Indian agency more closely attuned to the needs of Indian people and responsible primarily for ensuring that the Queen's promises with respect to treaties and lands are kept.

...appoint a Royal Commission to consult with the Indians and to study and recommend acceptable procedures for the adjudication of claims.

We reject the appointment of a sole Commissioner because he has been appointed without consultation and by the Government itself. He is not impartial and he has no power to do anything but a whitewash job. The Government should now, in consultation with the Indians, implement its' compaign promise to establish an "independent, unbiased, unprejudiced" Commisssion and it should have the power to call for any witnesses or documents that it, or the Indians, wish. Its judgments should be binding.

Date Due

MAR 20 '84 DEC 20	RETURN APR 1 6		
APR 1 '86	RETURN MAY 1 2 '00		
OCT 8 '87		RETURN JUL 26 00	
OCT 23 '87			
JAN 4 '88			
DUE	JAN 02 '96		
DEC 1 0	RETURN		
JUL 29	RETURN		
RETURN	MAR 24 '97		
RETURN	DEC 11 '97		
RETURN APR 1 6			

Pam: 325.3:(*41) WPRP

A Summary comparison of the government "White Paper" and the Indians "Red Paper".

#16446

Boreal Institute for Northern Studies Library
CW 401 Bio Sci Bldg
The University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB Canada T6G 2E9